

## Survey of editions of the *Nyāyabhāṣya* and their sources

### Abbreviations:

ASC = Asiatic Society, Calcutta

BL = British Library

BORI: Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Pune

EIP = Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies (3rd. rev. edition, Vol. 1, Sec. 1, 1995); for the Internet version, cf. Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies (<http://faculty.washington.edu/kpotter/>) (Latest version: 20 April 2009)

KVK = Karlsruher Virtueller Katalog (<http://www.ubka.uni-karlsruhe.de/kvk.html>)

IND/TB/Ph = call number, South Asian, Tibetan and Buddhist Studies Library, University of Vienna

KSDSU = Kameshwara Singh Darbhanga Sanskrit University, Darbhanga

LC = Library of Congress

NLK = National Library, Kolkata

TUUB = call number, Tübingen University Library, University of Tübingen (<http://opac.ub.uni-tuebingen.de/>)

UCL = call number, University of Chicago Library, University of Chicago

1. [C1<sub>E</sub>] Jayanarayana Tarkapanchanana. *Bibliotheca Indica* 50 (N.S. 56, 67, 70). Calcutta 1864-1865. [EIP 48.1.4] [Ph I 6: 280]

Sources: Three sources are mentioned in the foreword; variants are recorded, but without specifying the source, i.e., “... *iti kvacit pāṭhaḥ*.”

(1) Correct ms. of Benares College Library.

(2) Fair ms. in Bengali script, belonging to a pandit of Nuddea.

(3) “Imperfect” ms. owned by the editor.

Remarks: One of the sources is probably a ms. preserved now at the ASC, and the word “imperfect” in (3) to be understood in the sense of “incorrect.” The first ms. may have been the single ms. of the NBh preserved in the Benares College Library listed by Fitzedward Hall in 1859; cf. *Ms. Concordance*, no. 98.

2. [C2<sub>E</sub>] Jivananda Vidyasagara. Calcutta 1874. [EIP 48.1.6] [TB A-7956-B<sub>1</sub> 28/97]

Sources: No sources mentioned.

Contents: The edition includes the *Nyāyavṛtti*.

3. [V1<sub>E</sub>] Keshava Shastri. *The Pandit* (N.S. ) Vol. 2, 1877-1878. [EIP 48.1.7] [Project Library (xerox)]

Sources: No sources mentioned.

Contents: The edition extends up to 1.1.35 and includes an English translation.

4. [C3<sub>E</sub>] Jivananda Vidyasagara. Calcutta 1893. 2nd ed. of C2<sub>E</sub>. [no entry in EIP] [TB A-7956-B<sub>2</sub> 28/97]

Sources: No sources mentioned.

Contents: The edition includes the *Nyāyavṛtti*.

5. [V<sub>2E</sub>] Gangadhara Shastri Tailanga. Vizianagram Sanskrit Series 9. Benares 1896. Reprint Delhi 1984 (Sri Garib Dass Oriental Series 12). [EIP 48.1.14] [Ph I 6: 321 (1984)]

Sources: Six manuscripts (*pustakaṣaṭkaṃ likhitam*) and two unspecified printed editions were consulted (cf. Bhūmikā, pp. 1-2).

- (1) Correct, but fragmented ms. from Asiatic Society, Calcutta. The editor reports that part of the commentary including Sūtra 4.1.58 (Ruben) (= V<sub>2E</sub> 4.1.61; C<sub>1E</sub>, C<sub>2E</sub>, C<sub>3E</sub> 4.1.60) is corrupt (*truṭita*); the text enclosed in angle brackets in the corresponding part “*prajāvittalokaiṣaṇā<bhyo ... lokaiṣaṇā>yāś ca*” is missing in all previously printed editions (*sarveṣv eva mudritapustakeṣu nopalabhyate*; cf. C<sub>1E</sub> p. 239, l. 1; C<sub>2E</sub> p. 155, l. 3; C<sub>3E</sub> p. 268, l. 16). This eye-skip resulted in the fact that the Sūtra ‘*pātracayāntānupapatteś ca phalābhāvaḥ*’ is missing in ‘all the printed editions,’ and also raised great confusion (*mahān bhramah*) among European scholars (*yuropadeśastha-mahāśaya*). This ms. is obviously not referred to with a numeral in the critical apparatus; cf. p. 221, note on lacuna (... *kalikātānītapustake 'pi truṭitaḥ* ...).
- (2) Faulty ms. from Pune, not used everywhere (*na sarvatropayojitam*), which means that this ms. was consulted for collation only occasionally and inconsistently. It seems that this ms. is not consistently referred to with a numeral in the apparatus.
- (3) Transcript of a complete, correct, undated and worn ms. owned by Meru Shastri of the High Court, Pune, now living in Benares.
- (4) Complete, undated, not very old nor very correct ms., received from Vindhreshvari Prasad Dvivedi, director of the library of the Government Sanskrit College.
- (5) Complete, very correct and undated ms., of which a copy has been prepared by the owner, Purnashrama Svami, a fellow-student of the editor’s *guru*.
- (6) Very old, incomplete ms., dated 1592, obtained from the principal of the College, Arthur Venis (= V<sub>4D</sub> ?).
- (7) Old, complete and correct ms. procured from Kūrmācalapradeśa (= Kumaon), his home-country, by Nityananda Pant Sharma, a scholar of grammar and student of the editor.
- (8) The editor mentions three previous editions from Calcutta, of which the first is based on a single ms. only and has afterwards twice been printed on this basis. This explanation does not comply with Jayanarayana Tarkapancanana's statement that he as the editor of C<sub>1E</sub> used three mss. for his edition, unless Gangadhara Shastri refers to another unknown edition. It can be assumed that Gangadhara Shastri referred to C<sub>1E</sub> and the two subsequent editions by Jivananda Vidyasagara (C<sub>2E</sub> and C<sub>3E</sub>).

Contents: The edition includes extracted texts from *Nyāyavārttika* and *Nyāyavārttikatātparyatīkā*, using their mss.

Remarks: Only mss. (2) to (7) seem to have sigla assigned to them. Obviously the edition is mainly based on a ms. of our group C31, possibly C<sub>1D</sub> (which bears editorial marks and shares the lacuna around 4.1.58) or C<sub>3D</sub> which both are preserved at the Sanskrit College, Calcutta, or even P<sub>7D</sub> from Anandashram, Pune. The rarely used siglum “Pu. 1” may refer to this ms. “Pu. 2” refers to readings also found in C<sub>4D</sub> (Sanskrit College, Calcutta) and

C6<sup>D</sup> (Asiatic Society, Calcutta), which are part of our group C23. “Pu. 3”, if used by itself, shows readings also found in P2<sup>D</sup> (BORI, Pune), a ms. of our group A21. However, if used in combination with other sigla, “Pu. 3” refers to readings found in our group C23. “Pu. 4” is used to indicate variants also found in C5<sup>D</sup> (Asiatic Society, Calcutta), a ms. of our group C23. Finally, “Pu. 5” shows interesting affinity to the readings of A8<sup>D</sup> (GJRI, Allahabad), a ms. that was presented by a person from Varanasi. A8<sup>D</sup> is also part of our group C23.

6. [C4<sub>E</sub>] Kalivara Vedantavagisa. Calcutta 1906 (B.S. 1313). [EIP 48.1.19] [NLK 180J/b-90-42, not available by interlibrary loan in Europe]

Sources: To be determined.

Contents: The edition covers Adhyāya 1 and is accompanied by a Bengali translation and the Skt. commentary (padaṭippaṇa) by the editor.

7. [C5<sub>E</sub>] Phanibhushana Tarkavagisha. 5 vols. Calcutta 1917-1929 (1324-1336 B.S.). Reprinted in 5 vols. West Bengal State Book Board. [no. 247 in the first edition of EIP, but no entry in EIP<sup>3</sup>] There were at least two reprints. The copy Ph I 6: 186 gives 1981<sup>1</sup>, 1984<sup>1</sup> and 1982<sup>1</sup> for first three volumes, and Preisendanz’s copy 1989<sup>2</sup>, 2000<sup>2</sup>, 2000<sup>2</sup>, 1988<sup>1</sup> and 1989<sup>1</sup> (the complete set). The first reprint series is also available at TUUB (26 A 4578), LC (B132.N8 G36512 1981) and UCL (B132.N8B365120 1981). All three catalogues indicate in brackets that the first volume of 1981 is a second edition. However, this information has erroneously been extracted from the preface to this volume, where it is stated that the reprint follows the second printing of 1346 (B.S. = 1939) of the second edition by the Bangiya Sahitya Parishad. The latter date is the one of the copy used by Matilal (cf. below).

Sources: To be determined.

Contents: The edition includes a Bengali translation and Bengali elucidation (ṭippaṇī).

Remarks: As regards the year of publication of the first edition, we follow the date indicated in the first Indian edition of EIP (Delhi 1970) (described merely as a Bengali translation; second edition of the first volume 1936), Kesavan 1970: 359, which accords with that given in Saha 1987 (where it is mentioned that the second edition of the first volume was published in 1936), and Thakur 1996a: vii (given as 1324-1336 B.S.). Randle 1930 mentions the completion of the first two volumes corresponding to the first two *adhyāya*-s, with the starting date of 1917 for the whole undertaking. The date of the original publication is given in Chattopadhyaya/Gangopadhyaya 1965-1974 (introduction to Vol. 1 of 1967, reprinted 1975) as 1324-1326 B.S. (= 1917-1919). Further dates are 1932-1935 according to Chakrabarti 1978, and 1346 B.S. (= 1939), probably referring to the second printing of the second edition by the Bangiya Sahitya Parishad, according to Matilal 1985.

8. Jivananda Vidyasagara. Calcutta 1919. 3rd ed. of C2<sub>E</sub>. [EIP 48.1.6] [not seen] [not available by interlibrary loan at TUUB and BL; UCL PK3831.G7N9 1919]

Sources: N/a.

Contents: The edition includes the *Nyāyavṛtti*.

Remarks: The actual year of publication could not be confirmed, although this edition and its year of publication “1919” are reported in EIP under 48.1.6. Considering the indication “*caturthasamskaraṇam*” on the imprint of edition C6<sub>E</sub>, we infer that there must have existed a third edition, which must have been published between 1893 (the year of the second edition) and 1919 (the year of the fourth edition), as it would seem strange that two different editions were published in the same year. EIP does not give any further information about the 3rd edition. See also the note on C6<sub>E</sub>.

9. [C6<sub>E</sub>] Ashubodha Vidyabhushana and Nityabodha Vidyaratna. 4th ed., Calcutta 1919. Reprint Delhi 1986. [EIP 48.1.92 (reprint)] [TUUB 29 A 1051 (1919); LC Microfiche 97/61186 (B)]

Sources: No sources mentioned, no variants recorded.

Contents: The edition includes the *Nyāyavṛtti*.

Remarks: 1919 is the same year of publication as given by EIP under 48.1.6 for the edition by Jivananda Vidyasagara listed as no. 8. The edition of 1919 could be identical with no. 8 because it is highly improbable that the two editors who are identified on the title page as the sons of Jivananda Vidyasagara edited and published the text for a fourth time in the very same year that their father published another, third edition. This third edition, however, remains undocumented. See also remarks on no. 8. The reprint edition is registered in EIP under 48.1.92.

10. [V3<sub>E</sub>] Lakshmana Shastri Jatapathin (Dravida), Ramashastri Bhandari (revs.), Vindhyeshvari Prasad Dvivedin (original conception). Kashi Sanskrit Series 43. Benares 1920. [EIP 48.1.35] [IND 7069 (Frauwallner Library); Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin - Preussischer Kulturbesitz, Berlin, Ser. 8351-43; microform at LC]

Sources: Although variant readings are listed, the sigla are not explained. The copy available to us does not contain a preface or introduction, and the *viṣayānukramaṇikā* does not suggest that some pages were mistakenly left out when the copy was bound. Further copies of this edition will have to be examined to clarify this point.

Observations on the sigla and abbreviations in the critical apparatus

- (1) Some sigla and abbreviations can be easily interpreted: kali(kātā), kā(śī), mu(drita), pu(staka), vijaya(nagarasamskṛtagranthamālā) (cf., e.g., pp. 28, 29), li(khita) (cf., e.g., p. 152), i(ti) (cf., e.g., pp. 25, 26, 28, 29), ‘kalikātāsthāmudritapu(stake) pā(ṭhaḥ)’ (cf., e.g., p. 11).
- (2) ‘kā. mu. pu.’ or ‘kā. pu. pā.’ may be V1<sub>E</sub>, or more probably V2<sub>E</sub>; this abbreviation is also used to record readings of the *Nyāyavṛtti*. Simple ‘pu. pā’ (cf., e.g., pp. 59, 60, 65, 66) may also refer to V2<sub>E</sub> because variants indicated with ‘pu. pā.’ correspond to readings of V2<sub>E</sub>. This edition may also be referred to with ‘kā. lā. pā.’ (cf., e.g., p. 20, n. 3), or ‘iti pā. kāśī. lāja.’ (cf., e.g., p. 20, n. 4), since it was published by the E.J. Lazarus.

- (3) Variant readings of some edition published in Kolkata are occasionally indicated (e.g., p. 18, nn. 1, 2, 5, 6) using the sigla 'kali.'. It still has to be clarified to which edition(s) these sigla refer.
- (4) Concerning the text of the *Nyāyavṛtti*, it is still to be determined which printed editions and mss. were utilized.
- (5) 'ka. pu.' (e.g., pp. 62, 63) seems to refer to the Sūtra. It could not yet be clarified which mss. were used for the text of the Sūtra. See also 'kha. sūtra pustake' and 'kha. sū. pustake'.
- (6) 'ka. mu. pu.' (e.g., pp. 55, 56) could not yet be identified. It cannot be C2<sub>E</sub> because the reading indicated as 'ka. mu. pā', which may be the same abbreviation as 'ka. mu. pu.', does not correspond to the reading of C2<sub>E</sub> (and C1<sub>E</sub>) (cf. p. 49, n. 1). There are, however, some cases where the readings indicated as coming from 'ka. mu. pu.' correspond to readings of C2<sub>E</sub>, for example, in the case of the *Nyāyabhāṣya* (p. 114, n. 1 and p. 153, n. 1) and the *Nyāyavṛtti* (p. 116, n. 2).
- (7) '2 pu.' sometimes appears in the critical apparatus as a source of variants in addition to those taken from V2<sub>E</sub> (p. 13, n. 8); this siglum also appears in the variants of the text of the *Nyāyavṛtti*. The reading adopted in V3<sub>E</sub> corresponds to the variant reading of '2 pu.' in the critical apparatus of V2<sub>E</sub> (p. 93, n. \*\*). Because the reading assigned to '2 pu.' on p. 93, n. \*\* of V2<sub>E</sub>, reappears on p. 155, n. 1 of V3<sub>E</sub>, 'ka. kā. pu. pā.' seems to refer to the readings of two witnesses, ka and kā.
- (8) It is not clear to which three manuscripts 'pustakatraya' refers. On p. 82, n. \*, the variant corresponds to the one assigned to '5 | 4 | 2 |' in V2<sub>E</sub> (p. 53).
- (9) It is unclear to which edition 'likhitapustake' (p. 22) refers.
- (10) 'ka. pā. pu. pā 3' (p. 82, n. 1) remains absolutely unclear.

Contents: The edition includes *Nyāyasūcīnibandha*, *Nyāyavṛtti* and Ramashastry's *Ṭippanī*.

11. [V4<sub>E</sub>] Ganganath Jha and Dhundhiraj Shastri. Chowkhambha Sanskrit Series 55. Benares 1920-1925. Reprint 1984. [EIP 48.1.36] [Project Library (xerox); TUUB; UCL B132. N8G364 1925a]

#### Sources:

- (1) Palm-leaf ms. in Maithili characters, up to commentary on 3.2.43, obtained from Shankaracharya Math, Puri.
- (2) Palm-leaf ms. in Maithili characters, from commentary on 1.2.4 to end, obtained from the same source.
- (3) Palm-leaf ms. for *adhyāya* 5, owned by Pandit Manishvar Jha of Lalganj, District Darbhanga.
- (4) Palm-leaf ms. for *adhyāya* 5, dated La. Sam. 479 (= 1598), same owner.
- (5) Paper ms. of the *sūtrapāṭha* belonging to Pandit Jagadisha Mishra Nyayopadhyaya, Lalganj.
- (6) Paper ms. of the *sūtrapāṭha*, part of the collection of Babu Govinda Dasa, Benares.
- (7) Edition V2<sub>E</sub> is mentioned as an additional source.

Contents: The edition includes Jha's *Khadyota* and Raghūttama's *Candra* on the *Nyāyabhāṣya*.

Remarks: The edition does not record any variant readings for the *Nyāyasūtra* nor for the *Nyāyabhāṣya*. The sigla suggested in the preface, such as A, B, C, D, Sūtra E, Sūtra D (*sic*) ('Styled A' and so on), may have been used in Jha's translation of the *Nyāyabhāṣya*; this matter should be further examined.

12. [P<sub>1E</sub>] Digambara Shastri Joshi. Anandashrama Sanskrit Series 91. Pune 1922. Reprint Pune 1984. [EIP 48.1.38] [Preisendanz's copy; IND/TB (repr. ordered; not yet arrived); UCL B132.N8G38 1985 (reprint)] [first edition (1922) is not available by interlibrary loan in Europe]

Sources:

- (1-3) 3 mss. of the Anandashram.
- (4) Ms. owned by Vasudeva Shastri Abhyankar.
- (5) Ms. preserved in BORI.
- (6) Ms. preserved at Fergusson College.

Contents: Includes the *Nyāyavṛtti*.

Remarks: The mss. are not further described; their sigla are introduced, although no variants are recorded in the edition, at least according to the 1984 reprint.

13. [B<sub>E</sub>] Sudarshanacharya Shastri Punjabi. Bombay 1922. Reprint Bombay 1986 (Sudhi Series 10), Varanasi 1998 (Bauddha Bharati Series 38). [EIP 48.1.40; 220.1.18 (?)] [Preisendanz's copy (1986); IND/TB (1986 ordered); Ph I 6: 312 (1998); interlibrary loan for the first edition (1922) failed at BL and TUUB]

Sources: No sources mentioned, but various readings, also from commentaries, are indicated and discussed in the commentary and appendix.

Contents: Includes the editor's *Prasannapadā Tīkā* and the *Nyāyasūcīnibandha*.

Remarks: EIP (no. 220.1.18) mentions a Varanasi edition of the *Nyāyabhāṣya* with Sudarshanacharya's *Prasannapadā* as edited by Dwarika Das Shastri, without indication of the series with the year 1986, which is probably identical with the edition in Bauddha Bharati Series. The 1998 reprint is edited by Dwarika Das Shastri under the title "Mahamuni Vatsyayana's Nyaya-Bhashya on Gautama-Nyaya-Sutras with Prasannapada Commentary of Pt. Sudarshanacarya, Shastri."

14. [Ma<sub>E</sub>] Thakur Udaya Narayan Singh. Madhurapur, Muzaffarpur: Shastra Publishing House, 1934. Reprint Delhi 1988 (Vrajajivana Pracyabharati Granthamala 34). [EIP 48.1.48] [NLK: 180JC 93.300; not found in TUUB, LC, KVK; reprint: BORI no. 62647]

Contents: Text followed by Hindi translation of commentary piece by piece on individual *sūtras*, no variants recorded, complete.

Remarks: There may have been an earlier edition of this book published in 1906 in Etawah (no. 234, p. 14) according to the first Indian edition of EIP.

15. [C<sub>7E</sub>] Amarendra Mohan Tarkatirtha, Taranatha Nyaya-Tarkatirtha, Hemanta Kumar Tarkatirtha. Calcutta Sanskrit Series 18. Calcutta 1936-1944. Reprint Kyoto 1982. 2nd ed.,

New Delhi 1985. [EIP 48.1.50] [Ph I 6:27 (Vol. 1 1936, Vol. 2 1944; reprint 1982); UCL B132.N8G3640 1985 (1985)]

Sources:

(1) Editions C1<sub>E</sub> ('ja'), V2<sub>E</sub> ('ga'), C5<sub>E</sub> ('pha'), V3<sub>E</sub> ('la'), V4<sub>E</sub> ('jhā'), and P1<sub>E</sub>(?) ('ā'), the last of which is not mentioned in the preface. Variant readings with siglum 'ā' are recorded for both the *Nyāyabhāṣya* and the *Nyāyavṛtti*. 'ā' could therefore refer to the Anandashram edition (P1<sub>E</sub>). Readings of two mss., whose sigla are 'B' (= 'vi') and 'T' (= 'ṭi'); those were noted by Vanamali Vedantatirtha of Kalighat in his personal copy of the text.

Contents: The edition includes *Nyāyavārttika*, *Nyāyavārttikatātparyāṭikā* and *Nyāyavṛtti*.

16. [P2<sub>E</sub>] Ganganath Jha. Poona Orientalist 1-10. Pune 1936-1945. Text reprinted as Poona Oriental Series 58, Pune 1939. [EIP 48.1.51] [Ph I 6:16]

Sources: No sources mentioned, no variant readings recorded.

Contents: The edition includes the *Nyāyasūcīnibandha* and an English translation.

17. [V5<sub>E</sub>] Padmaprasad Shastri and Hariram Shukla. Kashi Sanskrit Series (Haridas Sanskrit Series) 43, Nyāya Sec. No. 6. Benares 1942. 2nd ed. of V3<sub>E</sub>. [EIP 48.1.58] [Ph I 6:193]

Sources: Variant readings and sigla are reproduced based on V3<sub>E</sub>; fresh typos were created when the text was reset.

Contents: Includes *Nyāyasūcīnibandha* and *Ṭippana*.

18. [Da<sub>E</sub>] Anantalal Thakur. Adhyāya 1. Mithila Institute Series Ancient Text 20. Darbhanga 1967. [EIP 48.1.70] [Ph I 6:101]

Sources: Jaisalmer ms. ('J') and editions C7<sub>E</sub> ('C'), V5<sub>E</sub> ('K') and C5<sub>E</sub> ('T'). The last siglum is used, but not defined by the editor.

Contents: The edition includes *Nyāyavārttika*, *Nyāyavārttikatātparyāṭikā* and *Nyāyavārttikatātparyapariśuddhi*.

19. [V6<sub>E</sub>] Padmaprasad Shastri and Hariram Shukla. Kashi Sanskrit Series 43. Varanasi 1983. 3rd ed. of V3<sub>E</sub>. [Preisendanz's copy; UCL B132.N8G65 1983]

Sources: No sources mentioned, no variants recorded.

Contents: Includes *Nyāyasūcīnibandha* and Hindi *Prakāśikā* by Dhundhiraj Shastri. Ed. by Narayana Mishra.

20. [V7<sub>E</sub>] Dvarika Das Shastri. Bauddha Bharati Series 11. Varanasi 1986. [EIP 48.1.67 (?)] [Preisendanz's copy; TUUB 25 A 11160 (3rd ed. 1984 [?])]

Sources: No sources mentioned, but variant readings are indicated in this "critical edition."

Contents: Includes Hindi translation.

Remarks: EIP mentions an edition by the same editor, without indication of the series under item no 48.1.67 with the year 1966 (*sic*), which is probably identical with this edition.

21. [G<sub>E</sub>] Shrinivasa Shastri. 3 Vols. Gaziabad: Indo-Vision Private Limited, 1986, 1987, 1992. [Ph I 6: 207; UCL B132.N8G36538 1986 (3 vols.); TUUB 27 A 12991 (3 vols.)]

Sources: Editions Da<sub>E</sub> and P2<sub>E</sub>, no variants recorded.

Contents: The edition includes the *Nyāyavārttika*, with Hindi translation and commentary. The three volumes correspond to adhyāya 1, 2 and 3, respectively.

22. [D1<sub>E</sub>] Anantalal Thakur. *Nyāyacaturgranthikā* 1. New Delhi 1997. [Ph I 6:281]

Sources: Jaisalmer ms. ('J'); editions C7<sub>E</sub> ('C'), V5<sub>E</sub> ('K') and C5<sub>E</sub> ('T'). The last siglum is used, but not defined by the editor.

Contents: The edition includes the *Nyāyabhāṣya* and the *sūtrapāṭha*.

23. [D2<sub>E</sub>] Sunanda Saccidananda Mishra. Delhi 1999. [EIP 48.1.101] [Ph I 6:300]

Sources: To be determined.

Contents: The edition includes Hindi commentary *Sunanda* by the editor.

24. [V8<sub>E</sub>] Dvarika Das Shastri. *Bauddha Bharati* Series 11. Varanasi 1999. New (fifth, enlarged and revised) edition of V7<sub>E</sub>. [Ph I 6: 311]

Sources: No sources mentioned, but variant readings are indicated in this "critical edition."

Contents: The edition includes Hindi translation.

25. [D3<sub>E</sub>] Raghunath Ghosh. Delhi 2003. [EIP 48.1.124] [Ph I 6: 320]

Sources: No sources mentioned, no variants recorded.

Contents: Reproduces the English summary of the *Nyāyabhāṣya* and English translation of the *Nyāyasūtra* by Satish Chandra Vidyabhusana (*The Nyāya Sūtras of Gotama*, The Sacred Books of the Hindus 8, Allahabad 1913) in different format, accompanied by editor's own foreword.

Remarks: It could be that D2<sub>E</sub> or B<sub>E</sub> (in the 1999 reprint) was consulted or utilized as the basis of the *Nyāyabhāṣya* text: the final colophons of these three editions are identical, namely, 'iti vidvadvaravātsyāyanaviracite nyāyabhāṣye pañcamo 'dhyāyaḥ samāptaḥ.' Furthermore, western punctuation, inserted in the text, such as dashes, equal signs, quotation marks and so on, are all placed in the same way as in D2<sub>E</sub>. The numbering of the *sūtras* in D2<sub>E</sub>, however, is not followed in D3<sub>E</sub>, maybe because the editor wished to follow Vidyabhusana in arranging and dividing the *sūtras*. There are some special editorial features in D3<sub>E</sub>, for example, the final colophon of 5.2 comes after that of the



fifth book as a whole; furthermore, if the above assumption is correct, a reading of D2<sub>E</sub> is silently corrected in the case of '*evam uktavān anuyujyate*' in D3<sub>E</sub> (p. 426, l. 14) against '*dharmā evam uktavān 'nuyujyate*' in D2<sub>E</sub> (p. 473, l. 6). A comparison of the three editions is required in order to corroborate the above hypothesis.